

ROUND "A" EVALUATION FORM (2005)

Team Name: _____

(Opposing Team Name: _____)

Name of Referee: _____

Each evaluation item should be evaluated on a 5-point scoring system. (You may give middle point if necessary like 3.5 or 4.5.), based on an absolute evaluation, rather than a comparative assessment. Accordingly, if, for example, both teams have performed in an exceptional manner, both teams should be given 5 points.

For the evaluation of the scores, the following suggestions may be helpful. An average performance should be awarded a score of 3. Your view of the result of the arbitration award (i.e., which team would have won the arbitration) should not be considered.

5 points: Excellent. Their performance matches that of young business persons and excellent as students.

4 points: Good. Very good as students.

3 points: Average.

2 points: Rather unsatisfactory.

1 point: Very unsatisfactory.

1. Logicality and Persuasiveness

General guidelines regarding Logicality and Persuasiveness:

Logicality and clarity of the arguments. Whether the explanation of law was persuasive. Whether the facts supporting the arguments were properly stated.

- (1) ISSUE 1: Regarding the responsibility of Blue with regard to the damage arising from the fact that the Happy Bridge was subjected to a passage prohibition.

_____points (1)

Criteria of evaluation:

Whether the arguments were well founded. Whether there was inconsistency within arguments. Whether the arguments were persuasive. Whether false logic was used as an excuse. Whether the team missed important arguments that should have been raised.

(2) ISSUE 2: Amount of damages _____points (2)

Criteria of evaluation:

Whether the arguments were well founded. Whether there was inconsistency within the arguments. Whether the arguments were persuasive. Whether false logic was used as an excuse. Whether the team missed important arguments that should have been raised.

(3) ISSUE 3: US\$5 million that Blue expended following the construction of ZONE B. _____points (3)

Criteria of evaluation:

Whether the arguments were well founded. Whether there was inconsistency within the arguments. Whether the arguments were persuasive. Whether false logic was used as an excuse. Whether the team missed important arguments that should have been raised.

(4) Whether opening statement and closing statement were well organized. _____points (4)

Criteria of evaluation:

Whether all important issues were covered. Whether the allocated time was used effectively. Whether statements were easy to understand and persuasive.

(5) Whether arguments and counter-arguments were persuasive. _____points (5)

Criteria of evaluation:

Whether arguments were persuasive. Whether

counter-arguments got to the heart of the matter. Whether arguments and counter-arguments were within the bounds of common sense.

2. Attitudes, behavior and teamwork

(1) Attitude, behavior and manner of discussion

_____points (6)

Criteria of evaluation:

Whether the player inadvertently gave way to his feeling.
Whether there was a personal attack. Whether the player tried to address arguments to arbitrators. Whether player's attitude and use of words were decent.

Examples of reasons for deducting points:

Losing one's head. Acts of impoliteness. Unduly soft voice.

Examples of reasons for enhancing score:

Being calm. Quick and witty response.

(2) Teamwork

_____points (7)

Criteria of evaluation:

Whether each member played his/her given role, coordinating efficiently with other team members.

3. Sufficiency of preparation

_____points (8)

Criteria of evaluation:

Whether all team members have studied well the problem, rules and UNIDROIT Principles. Whether all team members have researched and understood well the relevant laws and facts.

4. Scoring of the Brief (x2)

_____points (9)

Criteria of evaluation:

Whether well organized. Whether sentences were easy to understand and clearly written. Whether the arguments were persuasively supported by law and facts.

(Attention: Please double the 5 scale points in order to place greater weight on this item.)

Total score Σ (1~9) = _____